Institute for Advanced Science,
Social and Sustainable Future

MORALITY BEFORE KNOWLEDGE

Analysing the patterns & impacts of five cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming

Ni Luh Tasya Prathisthita Tanaya¹, Ni Made Martini Puteri¹*

¹ *Department of Criminology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Indonesia, Depok, West Java, 16424, Indonesia*
*Correspondence: martini.puteri@ui.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Background: Child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is more than just a sexual act. Live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse is a form of serious crime that causes real harm to victims. **Methods**: This research uses a secondary data analysis method. The data analysed are data from five cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming in Indonesia. The five cases were sourced from national and regional news media, obtained online, which have been verified by the Press Council. The data was analysed using a qualitative approach. **Findings**: The data findings showed that only two out of the five cases where the operators aimed to gain financial benefits, namely in case 2 and case 5. Whereas, in case 1 and case 3, it was found that the operators aimed to fulfil their own sexual satisfaction. Then, the operators in case 4 aimed to fulfil the sexual gratification of the audience. This shows that the assumption that the motive of the operators to sexually exploit and abuse children through live streaming for the purpose of financial gain is not entirely true. The pattern of perpetrators of live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse, both operators and viewers, is based on their goals. **Conclusion**: Both operators and viewers play a major role in the sexual exploitation and abuse of children through live streaming. The impact of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is similar to experiencing sexual violence directly by many people. **Novelty/Originality of This Study**: Money was not found to be the main motive for this crime. Instead, these crimes occur because the perpetrators, both operators and viewers, want to satisfy their sexual desires. Child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming was found to be more harmful in impact similar to experiencing live sexual abuse.

KEYWORDS: children; exploitation; live streaming; negative impacts; perpetrators and viewers; sexual violence.

1. Introduction

Technology enables sexual expression that is not possible in the real world, making it easier for perpetrators to target children and to share information (Davidson & Gottschalk, 2010; Martelozzo, 2012; UN News, 2020). KPAI (2014) found child pornography sites through Nawala records and 6 cases of online child trafficking through NGOs in Surabaya. ECPAT Indonesia in 2019 found that of the total cases of child sexual exploitation and violence, 35% of the total cases were carried out online. The results of ECPAT Indonesia's survey of 1,203 children in the first semester of 2020 showed that 287 children had bad experiences while using the internet.

This research focuses on child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming. Dingle (2014) stated that child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is the

worst form of online child sexual exploitation and abuse (Ramiro et al, 2019, p. 2). In this form, children are forced to perform sexual activities as requested by viewers in real time through video sharing platforms, for monetary rewards or for sexual gratification (Desara, 2019). This often occurs on social media apps, video chat apps, and online chat rooms (Desara, 2020). Viewer access to content can range from public to paid (Horsman, 2018, p. 108). It was found that 1,000 adults, mostly men, from 71 countries requested live streaming of child sexual content (Terre des Hommes, 2013). ECPAT Indonesia found crimes using webcam schemes involving perpetrators from Indonesia and outside Indonesia. They pay perpetrators to commit sexual violence against children and broadcast live streaming (Binus Law, 2020).

Viewers can see new content that has not yet spread across the internet and do not need to download the content, leaving no evidence (Horsman, 2018; Desara, 2020). It is also inexpensive to watch (Horsman, 2018). Then, live streaming content is shaped by sexual demand from the audience (Acar, 2017). This means that viewers not only watch, but can determine the course of the content (Desara, 2019), as if the viewers are also directly committing sexual violence against children (Desara, 2020). Viewers can gain access to children who match their sexual interests and request behaviours that match their sexual fantasies (Whittle & Giachritsis, 2017).

From the situation of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming above, two groups of perpetrators can be identified. The first is the operator, who produces the live streaming content and commits live sexual violence against children according to the audience's request (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). Then, the second perpetrator is the audience. The audience itself is divided into two, namely passive and active viewers (Elsheranki, 2020).

The majority of operators who exploit children for monetary gain are family members, and foreigners operating in syndicates (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). Parents can also become operators through the persuasion of potential audiences. For example, this was done by Power, a man from Bellingham. He has persuaded many parents in the Philippines to produce live streaming child sexual content in exchange for money (Masri, 2014). Operators operating in syndicates, meanwhile, recruit and forcibly traffic children to perform live streaming sex shows on a regular basis (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019).

In Indonesia, child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming was found with the aim of financial gain and sexual gratification. For the purpose of financial gain, a syndicate operating model was found by a group of young men in West Jakarta. The victims were manipulated into creating sexual content through phone sex, video call sex, and live streaming with the lure of only Rp50,000 per content (Kompas, 2020). The network has more than 600 subscribers and the perpetrators earn IDR 4,000,000 per month. It can be seen that the amount of money received by the perpetrators is much greater than that given to the child victims. Then, the amount of money received by the victims is far less than the sexual violence they experienced.

Online child sexual exploitation and abuse can cause real harm to its victims (Powel & Henry, 2017). Victims experience victimisation from various forms of violence. The violence experienced ranges from direct sexual violence to economic violence (Cruz & Sajo, 2015). This causes children to experience what is called multiple victimisation. Finkelhor (2008) defines multiple victimisation as a form of victimisation where children are victims of more than one type of crime that can be committed by the same perpetrator.

Victims also experience revictimisation. In some cases, operators and viewers record and disseminate live streaming content (Horsman, 2018; Desara, 2019). This is done to attract more viewers (Desara, 2019), as well as to threaten the victim (IWF, 2017; Desara, 2019). Victimised content can be shared continuously for an unlimited amount of time (Horsman, 2018). Online child exploitation and abuse is real (Powel & Henry, 2017, p. 68). There is a need to recognise that child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is more than just a sexual act. This is because the act involves transmission where the audience is prepared to pay to watch, and involves manipulation of children to willingly

fulfil the demands of the audience (Desara, 2020, p. 216). It is important to realise that child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is a form of serious crime that causes real harm to victims.

2. Methods

This research uses the secondary data analysis method. Secondary data analysis relies on data collected by others, such as research results, surveys, and content analysis (Neuman, 2014). The data analysed were data from five cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming in Indonesia. The five cases were sourced from national and regional news media, obtained online, which have been verified by the Press Council. However, some unverified news media were selected as data sources to fulfil data categorisation. Other data sources were literature studies such as international journal articles, books, institutional data, and previous studies. The data was processed using a qualitative approach. Qualitative approaches provide detailed descriptions and analyses of the substance of human experience (Marvasti, 2004). In criminology, the qualitative approach allows researchers to understand the reality of crime from the perspective of the individuals involved, such as offenders, victims, and law enforcement (Noaks & Wincup, 2004). The disadvantages of this study are the small amount of data and the secondary nature of the data.

The selection of cases as data was done by searching the internet with the keywords 'live streaming child sexual abuse cases', 'live streaming child sexual abuse cases', 'live child abuse cases', 'video call sex child abuse cases', 'Skype child abuse cases', 'Whatsapp child abuse cases', 'live streaming child pornography cases', 'video call sex child pornography cases', 'Whatsapp child pornography cases', and 'live streaming child pornography network cases'. Various keywords are completed with the year, ranging from 2015 to 2021. Through these keyword searches, only five cases were found. The five cases were also selected because they were sourced from news media that have been verified by the Press Council. The ranking of the five cases is based on the time of occurrence, namely one case in 2017 (Case 1), two cases in 2019 (Case 2 and Case 3), and two cases in 2020 (Case 4 and Case 5).

Information from the five cases was categorised to include the demographics of the operator, the operator's relationship with the victim, the active audience, the passive audience, the audience's access to the victim, the audience's relationship with the operator, the purpose of the operator and the audience, the operator's modus operandi, the operator's rationalisation, the demographics of the victim, the sexual activity performed on the victim, the victimisation experienced by the victim, and the community's reaction. One case requires 3 to 4 online news media so that the information obtained can meet the data categorisation. The total number of online news media used was 19 online news media. For more details, see the table 1 below.

Table 1. News findings data

No	Year	Case Overview	Media and Title	Source
1	2017	A 41-year-old man conducted a live show of sexual violence against his biological daughter and niece on Skype. The live show could be watched by members of the Whatsapp, Telegram, and Skype groups to which the perpetrator	Liputan 6 - Begini Modus Kejahatan Agus Si Pedofilia Melalui Skype	https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/2963815/begini-modus-kejahatan-agus-si-pedofil-melalui-skype
			Kompas - Ayah ini Berbuat Asusila terhadap Anak Sembari "Live" di Skype	https://amp.kompas.com/megapolitan/read/2017/05/24/17051191/ayah.ini.berbuat.asusila.terhadap.anak.sembari.live.di.skype.

		belonged. The perpetrator then disseminated recordings of his live shows in these groups.	Republika - Pedofil Tayangkan Aksi Via Skype Ditangkap Polisi	https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/jabodetabek-nasional/17/05/25/oqgvf3330-pedofil-tayangkan-aksi-via-skype-ditangkap-polisi
			Tribunnews - Agus Iswanto Pengidap Pedofilia Ini Menyesal Setelah Cabuli Anak Kandung dan Keponakan Sendiri	https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2017/05/25/agus-iswanto-pengidap-pedofilia-ini-menyesal-setelah-cabuli-anak-kandung-dan-keponakan-sendiri
2	2019	Five 23-year-old men created Line groups that provided different facilities, including video call sex, phone sex, live shows, and live streaming of sexual intercourse with children. One of the children was 17 years old. They required group members to pay Rp 100,000-Rp 300,000 every month in order to continue enjoying the facilities. They pay the victims, who are children, to continue to be willing to perform the facilities ordered by them.	Kompas - Pelajar Perempuan Terlibat dalam Praktik Prostitusi Online via Line	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/19244241/pelajar-perempuan-terlibat-dalam-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-line
			Kompas - Polisi Bongkar Praktik Prostitusi "Online" Via Aplikasi Line	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/06/10215151/polisi-bongkar-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-aplikasi-line?page=all
			Kompas - Polisi Selidiki Video Porno Anak-anak di Kasus Prostitusi Online via Line	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/20282301/polisi-selidiki-video-porno-anak-anak-di-kasus-prostitusi-online-via-line
3	2019	A 27-year-old man threatened 10 children aged 9 to 15 to have video call sex with him via Whatsapp. The perpetrator targeted the victims through an online gaming application. The perpetrator recorded the video call sex without the knowledge of the victims. The perpetrator used the video recordings to threaten the victims to continue to be willing to comply with his invitation to video call sex. The perpetrator distributed video recordings of the victims to a Whatsapp group with approximately 100 members.	CNN Indonesia - Polisi Tangkap Pelaku Pornografi Video Call Anak-anak	https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20190729165121-12-416493/polisi-tangkap-pelaku-pornografi-video-call-anak-anak
			Kumparan - Polisi Ungkap Kasus Pornografi Anak Bermodus Video Call Via Whatsapp	https://kumparan.com/kumparannews/polisi-ungkap-kasus-pornografi-anak-bermodus-video-call-via-whatsapp-1rYuZebzZUm
			Kompas - Ancam Anak di Bawah Umur Lakukan Video Call Sex, AAP Cari Korban Lewat Game	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/17293361/ancam-anak-di-bawah-umur-lakukan-video-call-sex-aap-cari-korban-lewat
			Kompas - Rekam Video Call Sex Anak, Tersangka Sebar ke Grup WA	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/18400181/rekam-video-call-sex-anak-tersangka-sebar-ke-grup-wa
4	2020	A 19-year-old woman was forced by her husband to abuse an 8-month-old baby. The perpetrator abused the victim while on a video call with her husband. This had	Kompas - Fakta Pembantu Cabuli Bayi 8 Bulan saat Video Call Suami, Berusia 19 Tahun dan Residivis Narkoba	https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/13/15150071/fakta-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-8-bulan-saat-video-call-suami-berusia-19-tahun?page=all

		happened 4 times. The perpetrator claimed that her husband threatened to kill her if she did not comply.	Kompas - Pembantu Ini Sudah 4 Kali Cabuli Bayi sambal Video Call Suami	https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/13/15203551/pembantu-ini-sudah-4-kali-cabuli-bayi-sambil-video-call-suami?page=all#page2
			Kompas - Seorang Pembantu Cabuli Bayi dan Disaksikan Suaminya via "Video Call"	https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/12/12584041/seorang-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-dan-disaksikan-suaminya-via-video-call
			Suara Jogja - Cabuli Bayi sambil VCS dengan Suami, Pengasuh Berlagak Gantikan Popok	https://amp.suara.com/jogja/2020/08/10/184003/cabuli-bayi-sambil-vcs-dengan-suami-pengasuh-berlagak-gantikan-popok
5	2020	Four young people created a Line group that provided phone sex, video call sex, and live streaming of children's sexual activities. One of the children was 14 years old. They required group members to pay group members to pay Rp. 100,000-Rp. 300,000 every month in order to continue enjoying the facilities provided. Especially for the live streaming facility, group members must pay Rp. 150,000 per show. The profit earned reaches Rp 4,000,000 per month. They pay the victims only Rp. 50,000 per content to continue to be willing to do the facilities ordered by them.	Kompas - 3 Pemuda Ditangkap, Buat Grup Berbayar Jual Pornografi Anak-anak	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/15563631/3-pemuda-ditangkap-buat-grup-berbayar-jual-pornografi-anak-anak
			Kompas - Fakta Terungkapnya Jaringan Penjual Video Pornografi Anak di Jakarta Barat	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/11/08591681/fakta-terungkapnya-jaringan-penjual-video-pornografi-anak-di-jakarta?page=all
			Kompas - Pemeran Anak dalam Konten Pornografi Dibayar Rp 50.000, KPAI: Tak Sebanding dengan Risikonya	https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/20084221/pemeran-anak-dalam-konten-pornografi-dibayar-rp-50000-kpai-tak-sebanding
			Suara - Polisi Ungkap Kasus VCS Anak di Bawah Umur, Tiga Pelaku Ditangkap	https://www.suara.com/news/2020/08/10/173116/polisi-ungkap-kasus-vcs-anak-di-bawah-umur-tiga-pelaku-ditangkap?page=all&_gl=1*x7c56a*_ga*YW1wLW13aHJQa2w4Z001dFlFTzhJUmQxNXFJeEUyeGZZOGJFLXYtc0cwQUJrYVVB6SEJ1OG1OckFKSkNOUTRGOVNKN28.

3. Results and Discussion

The data findings show that all victims in all five cases experienced sexual violence and were live-streamed. In case 1, Skype was used for live streaming (Liputan6, 2017; Republika, 2017). For case 2 and case 5, the media used was Line (Kompas, 2019; Suara, 2020). Meanwhile, case 3 used Whatsapp (Kumparan, 2019). In case 4, it is not clearly known what kind of media was used to live stream, but what was used was private chat social media (Kompas, 2020).

By being broadcast live, the sexual violence experienced by the victim, both in person and online, can be watched by people other than the perpetrator who committed the sexual

violence in real time. Europol defines child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming as 'the live broadcast of a video of a child experiencing sexual violence or abuse, where the perpetrator's actions are directed by the audience, or there is an audience that is only watching remotely' (Desara, 2019, p. 38). Based on the definition by Europol, it can be said that the five cases of online child sexual exploitation and abuse that became the data in this research are a form of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming.

Rodriguez-Gil, Orduna, Zubia, and Ipina (2017) explain that live streaming can be done through a variety of social media, ranging from public to private. Meanwhile, all operators in all five cases used private social media. The perpetrators used Skype, Line, and Whatsapp, which allowed the live streaming content not to be watched by 'everyone'. The only people who watch are those who are members of the same group as the perpetrator or who exchange contacts with the perpetrator.

The five cases that became research data were analysed with aspects of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming. These aspects distinguish live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse from other forms of online child sexual exploitation and abuse.

3.1 Patterns of perpetration in child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming

This research shows that there are two groups of perpetrators in child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming, namely operators and viewers. Operator perpetrators are those who produce live streaming content and sexually abuse victims. In contrast, audience actors are actors who are not physically present and who watch live streaming content (Whittle & Giachritsis, 2017; Desara, 2019). Spectator perpetrators can be divided into passive spectators and active spectators. Passive spectators are spectators who only watch sexual violence on victims, while active spectators are spectators who direct operators to commit sexual violence on victims (Desara, 2019; Elsheranki, 2020). Based on the data findings, all cases had both groups of perpetrators, namely operators and spectators.

The results showed that the mode of operation of perpetrators of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming, both operators and viewers, is based on their goals. Operators were found to aim for financial gain, as they had no interest in engaging in sexual activity with the victims (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). However, the data findings showed that only two out of five cases where the operators aimed for financial gain, namely in case 2 and case 5. Whereas, in case 1 and case 3, it was found that the operators aimed to fulfil their own sexual satisfaction. Then, the operators in case 4 aimed to fulfil the sexual gratification of the audience. This shows that the assumption that the operators' motive for live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse is for financial gain is not entirely correct.

The operators in Case 2 and Case 5, with the aim of financial gain, operated in syndicates. Syndicates were found to be a common modus operandi used by the operators. Syndicates operate by recruiting children, who are then held in a location to live stream sex shows (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Carback, 2018; Desara, 2019). The operators in case 2 and case 5 were also found to recruit victims to live stream sexual content, but the children were not held in a location. The operators created Line groups for live streaming, in the form of video call sex facilities, live shows/live streaming of children's sexual activities, and live streaming of children's sexual relations with adults (Kompas, 2019; Kompas, 2020). Children were found to be creating live streaming content in their own homes, with the victims of case 2 admitting that they did so at night when their parents were asleep (Kompas, 2019).

In both cases, operators also provide live streaming content on a paid basis. Viewers are required to pay a predetermined amount per month (Kompas, 2019; Kompas, 2020). There is no clear information on the total profit made by the operators in case 2 and how much money was paid to the victims. However, judging from the fees charged and the number of viewers, it can be said that the operators made a large amount of profit. In case 5, it was

reported that the operators' profits reached Rp4,000,000 per month. Meanwhile, the victims of case 5 were only paid IDR 50,000 per content (Kompas, 2020).

Case 1 and case 3, where the operators aimed to fulfil their own sexual gratification, had a different modus operandi to the operators of case 2 and case 5. The operator in case 1 was the father and uncle of the victims. This illustrates that the findings of the organisation Terre des Hommes (2013) and various exposures that family members become operators for financial gain (Masri, 2014; Carback, 2018; Desara, 2019), are not entirely correct. Operators were found to directly sexually assault victims while live streaming on Skype (Liputan6, 2017; Republika, 2017). Before live streaming, operators were found to always invite members of Whatsapp, Telegram and Skype groups to watch. Operators were also found to often conduct person-to-person live streaming for members in these groups (Kompas, 2017). This is in line with what Desara (2019) described, that operators who aim to fulfil their own sexual gratification usually involve other viewers to watch.

Case 3 has a different pattern of perpetrators from the other four cases. The perpetrator acts as an operator and spectator at the same time, where the perpetrator asks and directs the victim to perform sexual acts while live streaming, without being physically present. This is consistent with the findings of IWF (2017) and Desara's (2019) explanation, that perpetrators who aim to fulfil their own sexual gratification, generally operate alone and perform two roles at once, namely as operators and spectators. In this modus operandi, operators recruit children through chat apps and online games, and then coerce and threaten children to live stream their own sexual exploitation (Broadhurst, 2019; Elshenraki, 2020).

The operator in case 3 recruited the victim through an online game application that has a policy of requiring players to provide their identity, such as photos and age (CNN Indonesia, 2019; Kompas, 2019). The operator's communication with the victim moved to Whatsapp, until finally the operator persuaded the victim to have video call sex while being secretly recorded by the operator (CNN Indonesia, 2019; Kumparan, 2019). The operator then used the recording to threaten the victim to continue to be willing to have video call sex with the operator. What the victims in case 3 experienced is in line with Elshenraki's (2020) statement. In this modus operandi, the majority of perpetrators record live streaming and use the footage to threaten victims to continue providing them with more explicit sexual content (IWF, 2017; Desara, 2019).

The operator in case 4, which had a different purpose compared to the other cases, was also found to have a different modus operandi. In case 4, the operator, who was the victim's babysitter, was coerced by the viewer, who was her own husband. She was forced to commit direct sexual violence against the victim while video calling with the viewer (Kompas, 2020; Suara Jogja, 2020). The operator even admitted that she was threatened with death by the audience (Kompas, 2020). What was experienced by the operator in case 4 is a modus operandi that is often carried out by the audience. Spectators often utilise people who have access to children to become operators (Masri, 2014; Whittle & Giachritsis, 2017). However, this differs from Masri's (2014) findings, which found that operators who carried out their actions at the behest of spectators were generally parents. What happened in case 4 shows that anyone with access to children can be taken advantage of by the audience.

The purpose of the operator not only determines their modus operandi, but also determines the audience's access to the victim's live streaming sexual content. Paid access was only found in case 2 and case 5. Meanwhile, operators in case 1, case 3, and case 4, provided live streaming sexual content for free. Viewers usually get free access because live streaming is broadcast on public social media (Horsman, 2018; Desara, 2019). However, the operators in the three cases with free access were found to be using private social media. This suggests that the assumption of free access due to live streaming content being streamed on public social media is not entirely true.

The data findings show that not all cases have two types of audiences. In case 1, there were 4,221 viewers from 28 international Whatsapp groups, 14,045 viewers from 50 international Telegram groups, and 1,023 viewers from 50 international Skype groups (Liputan6, 2017). Followed by the number of viewers in case 5 with more than 600 viewers,

and case 2 with more than 500 viewers, which came from Line groups (Kompas, 2019; Kompas, 2020). Meanwhile, in cases 3 and 4 there was only 1 viewer, who was an active viewer (Kumparan, 2019; Suara Jogja, 2020).

The research shows that the number of viewers can be linked to viewers' access to the victim's live streaming content. There were similarities in the audience access to the victim's live streaming content in case 1, case 2, and case 5, namely by being a member of the same social media group as the operator or created by the operator. However, there are differences in audience access in case 1 compared to case 2 and case 5. In case 1, audience access was obtained for free. Meanwhile, in case 2 and case 5, audience access is paid. Then, there is a significant difference in the number of social media groups. The audience in case 1 came from dozens of groups on three different social media, whereas the audience in cases 2 and 5 only came from groups on one social media.

When it comes to the demographics of the victims, there were no notable differences in the three cases with the highest number of viewers. The victims in case 1, case 2, case 3, and case 5 were of similar age. Case 2 and case 5 had more victims than case 1, so it is possible that there were younger victims. The youngest victim was found in case 4, which was 8 months old. The victims in most cases were female. The exception was case 1, where no clear information was found about the victim's gender. Thus, the finding that the number of viewers was highest in case 1 cannot be attributed to the gender of the victim. In case 1, only two forms of sexual activity were found. The sexual activity that occurred in case 1 was also found in other cases. Meanwhile, more forms of sexual activity were found in case 2 and case 5 that were not found in case 1, including masturbation and dancing while naked.

It can be said that case 1 has the largest number of viewers due to the ease and amount of access for viewers. Audience access can be obtained through Skype, Whatsapp and Telegram. Viewers only need to join the same group as the operator on these three social media to watch live streaming content, without the need to spend a cent to watch. Although the largest number of viewers was found in case 1, case 2 and case 5 also had very large numbers of viewers despite the paid access. These two cases show that there were more than 500 viewers from case 2 and more than 600 viewers from case 5 who were willing to pay to watch live streaming of child sexual abuse.

This is in accordance with Desara's (2019) statement, viewers are often found willing to pay to watch live streaming content. This illustrates that viewers find live streaming content more interesting than content that is not real time. According to Desara (2019), viewers are ready to pay to watch live streaming content of children who can fulfil their sexual satisfaction. Live streaming content is considered more attractive because it does not leave any evidence, the costs incurred are quite affordable, and the audience gets the experience of abusing the child directly (Acar, 2017; Horsman, 2018; Desara, 2020).

The viewers in most cases were found to be from Indonesia. This is in accordance with ECPAT Indonesia's findings reported in Binus Law (2020), namely that there is a high demand from viewers in Indonesia for live streaming sexual content for children. Only 1 case was found to have viewers from other countries, namely from Mexico, Costa Rica, and Yemen (Liputan6, 2017). This is because the groups to which the operators belong are international. This is in contrast to the findings of the organisation Terre des Hommes (2013), which found that the majority of viewers were from other countries with much better conditions than the operators' countries. However, the findings in case 1 also show that there is demand from viewers outside Indonesia for live streaming content of Indonesian children. The high demand for child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming illustrates what Rodas (2014) states, that this crime is not an occasional occurrence, but happens every day on various social media.

It can be seen that two groups of perpetrators, namely operator and audience, both play a major role in the occurrence of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming. The existence of these two groups of actors causes sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming to occur in two worlds at once, namely offline and online. Children experience sexual violence directly, either through their own actions or those of the operator, and can be watched in real time by a remote audience. The audience also commands the sexual

violence experienced by children. Then, it is the audience that creates a high demand for children's live streaming sexual content, where the audience is even willing to pay continuously in order to watch children's live streaming sexual violence content. The audience was also found to utilise people who have access to children to become operators.

On the one hand, money was not found to be the main motive for this crime. Instead, these crimes occur because the perpetrators, both operators and viewers, want to satisfy their sexual appetites. Because the operators did not want to earn money, they ended up providing the live streaming content of child sexual abuse for free. This means that anyone can easily watch live streaming content of sexual violence against Indonesian children and anyone can become an operator. This shows how vulnerable Indonesian children are to becoming victims of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming.

3.2 Forms of sexual activities performed on victims in child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming

The sexual activities in all five cases were found to fulfil the seven forms of sexual activity identified by the Terre des Hommes organisation (2013) in child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming. In each case, there were at least two of the seven forms of sexual activity. The highest number of sexual activities was found in case 2, which was four sexual activities.

Table 2. Matrix of sexual activities committed against the victim

Sexual Activity	Case				
	Case 1	Case 2	Case 3	Case 4	Case 5
Dancing while naked	–	✓	–	–	✓
Showing genitals/body parts	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Masturbation	–	✓	✓	–	✓
Using sex toys	–	–	–	✓	–
Performing sexual acts with fellow children	–	–	–	–	–
Performing sexual acts with adults	✓	✓	–	–	–
Performing sexual acts with animals	–	–	–	–	–

It can be seen that the highest number of sexual activities was found in case 2, with four sexual activities. This was followed by case 5, which had three sexual activities. This can be attributed to the operators' goals. In case 2 and case 5, the operators were both aiming for financial gain. The number and variety of sexual activities is likely an attempt to attract viewers. The more interesting the live streaming content offered, the more willing the viewers are to pay the operators.

Although the table shows that there are similar forms of sexual activity between cases, the data findings show that there are differences in the groups of perpetrators who perform these activities. In case 1, case 3, and case 4, it was the operator who performed the sexual activity on the victim or ordered the victim to perform the sexual activity on herself. In contrast, in case 2 and case 5, it was the spectator who performed sexual activity on the victim or ordered the victim to perform sexual activity on herself. The audience in case 2 was even found to have directly sexually assaulted the victim in the live streaming facility of sexual relations between children and adults (Kompas, 2019). This shows that the finding that only the operator commits sexual violence against the victim while the audience only commands from afar, is not entirely true.

The difference in the group of perpetrators who performed sexual activity on the victims can be attributed to the purpose of the operators. Operators in case 1 and case 3 aimed to fulfil their own sexual satisfaction. Meanwhile, operators in case 2 and case 5 aimed to gain financial benefits. Case 4 had different sexual activities compared to the other four cases. This can be attributed to the various characteristics of case 4 which are also

different from the other four cases. The operator in case 4 had a different demographic, being the only female operator and younger than the male operators at 19 years old.

In addition, case 4 had the youngest victim age of 8 months. The young age of the victim may have meant that other sexual activities could not be performed on the victim. Then, this can also be attributed to the purpose of the operator, where the operator carried out his actions not of his own free will, but because he was forced by the spectator, who was his husband. It can be seen that the sexual violence activities carried out by the perpetrators against the victim were based on the goals of the perpetrators.

3.3 Impact of live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse on victims

From the data findings, no information was found describing the losses obtained by the victims. This does not mean that the victims did not suffer any losses. Child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming was found to be more harmful than other forms of online or in-person abuse. For victims, the impact is similar to experiencing live sexual violence by many people. This is because, although the perpetrator of the live abuse is one individual, that person is directed and witnessed by several other individuals in real time, as if they were directly involved. Only live streaming makes this possible (Desara, 2019).

The victim in case 4, who was 8 months old, was found to have redness on her genitals due to the sexual violence she experienced (Kompas, 2020). Broadhurst (2019) mentioned that victims of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming experienced physical losses due to the direct sexual violence they experienced, such as injuries, etc. In case 1 and case 2, where the victims also experienced direct sexual violence, there was no information on the physical damage they suffered. For case 1 and case 2, where the victims also experienced direct sexual violence, there is no information about the impact on the victims. However, it is likely that the victims in case 1 and case 2 also suffered physical harm as a result of the direct sexual violence they experienced.

Victims are not only physically harmed, but also psychologically. Research by Terre des Hommes (2013) in the Philippines found that victims suffered from high levels of psychosocial distress manifested in sexual trauma, a sense of betrayal, social stigmatisation and helplessness. When compared to children from similar neighbourhoods and socio-economic backgrounds, the child victims of exploitation and child abuse through live streaming exhibited low self-esteem, often feeling disgusted with their activities to the point of feeling unworthy to continue living. There is a high likelihood that the victims in all five cases also suffered the harms described in Terre des Hommes' (2013) research in the Philippines. Especially considering that one of the victims had a disability, namely the 10-year-old victim in case 1. The victim was found to be mentally challenged (Tribunnews, 2017). It can be seen that, although this crime occurred online, the victims suffered various direct losses.

5. Conclusions

Child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming is a very complex phenomenon that involves various actors with complicated operational patterns. Both operators and viewers play a major role in the occurrence of child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming. The existence of these two groups of actors causes sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming to occur in two worlds at once, namely offline and online. Children experience sexual violence directly, either through their own actions or those of the operator, and can be watched in real time by a remote audience. The audience also commands the sexual violence experienced by children. The data findings showed that in only two of the five cases did the operators aim to gain financial benefits, namely in case 2 and case 5. Whereas, in case 1 and case 3, it was found that the operators aimed to fulfil

their own sexual satisfaction. Then, the operators in case 4 aimed to fulfil the sexual gratification of the audience. This shows that the assumption that the motive of operators in live streaming child sexual exploitation and abuse is for financial gain is not entirely correct. On the one hand, money was not found to be the main motive for this crime. Instead, these crimes occur because the perpetrators, both operators and viewers, want to satisfy their sexual appetites. Child sexual exploitation and abuse through live streaming was found to be more dangerous than other forms of online or in-person abuse. For victims, the impact is similar to experiencing live sexual violence by many people.

Author Contribution
The author contributed fully to the research.

Funding
This research did not receive funding from anywhere.

Ethical Review Board Statement
Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement
Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement
Not applicable.

Conflicts of Interest
The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Open Access

References

Acar, K. V. (2017). Webcam Child Prostitution: An Exploration of Current and Futuristic Methods of Detection. *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*, Vol. 11, pp. 98-109

Binus Law. (2020). *Perlindungan Anak dari Eksploitasi Seksual Online Selama Covid-19*. Diakses melalui https://business-law.binus.ac.id/2020/05/29/perlindungan-anak-dari-eksploitasi-seksual-online-selama-covid-19/

Broadhurst, R.G. (2019). *Child Sex Abuse Images and Exploitation Materials* dalam buku Handbook of Cybercrime. Oxon: Routledge

Carback, J. (2018). Cybersex Trafficking: Toward a More Effective Prosecutorial Response. *Criminal Law Bulletin*, Vol. 54, pp. 66-183

CNN Indonesia. (2019). *Polisi Tangkap Pelaku Pornografi Video Call Anak-Anak*. Diakses melalui https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20190729165121-12-416493/polisi-tangkap-pelaku-pornografi-video-call-anak-anak

Cruz, E.M., & Sajo, T.J. (2015). Exploring The Cybersex Phenomenon In The Philippines. *EJISDC*, Vol. 5, pp. 1-21

Davidson, J., & Gottschalk, P. (2010). *Internet Child Abuse: Current Research and Policy*. Oxon: Routledge

Desara, D. (2020). *Combating the Live-Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse and Sexual Exploitation: A Need for New Legislation* dalam buku Second International Handbook of Internet Research. Switzerland: Springer Nature

Desara, D. (2019). *The Phenomenon of Online Live-Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse: Challenges and Legal Responses*. Doctoral Dissertation, THE Luxembourg University. Bologna, Italy

Elshenraki, H.N. (2020). *Combating the Exploitation of Children in Cyberspace: Emerging Research and Opportunities*. Pennsylvania: IGI Global

Finkelhor, D. (2008). *Childhood Victimization: Violence, Crime, and Abuse in the Lives of Young People*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Horsman, G. (2018). A forensic examination of the technical and legal challenges surrounding the investigation of child abuse on live streaming platforms: A case study on Periscope. *Journal of Information Security and Applications*, Vol. 42, pp. 107-117

IWF. (2017). *Trends in Online Child Sexual Exploitation: Examining the Distribution of Captures of Live-streamed Child Sexual Abuse*.

KPAI. (2014). *Kekerasan Seksual (Online) Pada Anak di Indonesia: Sebuah Respon Atas Kebijakan Negara*. Diakses melalui https://www.kpai.go.id/berita/artikel/kekerasan-seksual-online-pada-anak-di-indonesia-sebuah-respon-atas-kebijakan-negara

Kompas. (2017). *Ayah Ini Berbuat Asusila Terhadap Anak Sembari Live di "Skype"*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2017/05/24/17051191/ayah.ini.berbuat.asusila.terhadap.anak.sembari.live.di.skype

Kompas. (2019). *Ancam Anak di Bawah Umur Lakukan Video Call Sex, AAP Cari Korban Lewat Game*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/17293361/ancam-anak-di-bawah-umur-lakukan-video-call-sex-aap-cari-korban-lewat

Kompas. (2019). *Pelajar Perempuan Terlibat dalam Praktik Prostitusi Online Via Line*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/19244241/pelajar-perempuan-terlibat-dalam-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-line

Kompas. (2019). *Polisi Bongkar Praktik Prostitusi Online Via Aplikasi Line*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/06/10215151/polisi-bongkar-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-aplikasi-line?page=all

Kompas. (2019). *Polisi Selidiki Video Porno Anak-Anak di Kasus Prostitusi Online Via Line*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/20282301/polisi-selidiki-video-porno-anak-anak-di-kasus-prostitusi-online-via-line

Kompas. (2019). *Rekam Video Call Sex Anak, Tersangka Sebar ke Grup WA*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/18400181/rekam-video-call-sex-anak-tersangka-sebar-ke-grup-wa

Kompas. (2020). *3 Pemuda Ditangkap Buat Grup Berbayar Jual Pornografi Anak-Anak*. Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/15563631/3-pemuda-ditangkap-buat-grup-berbayar-jual-pornografi-anak-anak

Kompas. (2020). *Fakta Pembantu Cabuli Bayi 8 Bulan Saat Video Call Suami Berusia 19 Tahun.* Diakses melalui https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/13/15150071/fakta-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-8-bulan-saat-video-call-suami-berusia-19-tahun?page=all

Kompas. (2020). *Fakta Terungkapnya Jaringan Penjual Video Pornografi Anak di Jakarta Barat.* Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/11/08591681/fakta-terungkapnya-jaringan-penjual-video-pornografi-anak-di-jakarta?page=all

Kompas. (2020). *Pemeran Anak dalam Konten Pornografi Dibayar Rp 50.000, KPAI: Tak Sebanding dengan Risikonya.* Diakses melalui https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/20084221/pemeran-anak-dalam-konten-pornografi-dibayar-rp-50000-kpai-tak-sebanding

Kompas. (2020). *Seorang Pembantu Cabuli Bayi dan Disaksikan Suaminya Via Video Call.* Diakses melalui https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/12/12584041/seorang-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-dan-disaksikan-suaminya-via-video-call

Kumparan. (2019). *Polisi Ungkap Kasus Pornografi Anak Bermodus Video Call Via Whatsapp.* Diakses melalui https://kumparan.com/kumparannews/polisi-ungkap-kasus-pornografi-anak-bermodus-video-call-via-whatsapp-1rYuZebzZUm/full

Liputan6. (2017). *Begini Modus Kejahatan Agus Si Pedofil Melalui Skype.* Diakses melalui https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/2963815/begini-modus-kejahatan-agus-si-pedofil-melalui-skype

Martelozzo, E. (2012). *Online Child Sexual Abuse: Grooming, Policing and Child Protection in a Multi-Media World.* Oxon: Routledge

Marvasti, A. B. (2004). *Qualitative Research in Sociology.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd

Masri, L. (2014). *Webcam Child Sex Abuse.* CUNY Academic Works. Diakses melalui https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gj_etds/64

Neuman, W. L. (2014). *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Harlow: Pearson Education Limited

Noaks, L., & Wincup, E. (2004). *Criminological Research: Understanding Qualitative Methods.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd

Powell, A., & Henry, N. (2017). *Sexual Violence in A Digital Age.* London: Palgrave Macmillan

Ramiro, L.S., Martinez, A.B., Tan, J.R., Mariano, K., Miranda, G.M., & Bautista, G. (2019). Online child sexual exploitation and abuse: A community diagnosis using the social norms theory. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, Vol. 96, pp. 1-13.

Republika. (2017). *Pedofil Tayangkan Aksi Via Skype Ditangkap Polisi.* Diakses melalui https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/jabodetabek-nasional/17/05/25/oqgvf3330-pedofil-tayangkan-aksi-via-skype-ditangkap-polisi

Rodriguez-Gil, L., Orduna, P., Zubia, G. J., Ipina, D.L. (2017). Interactive live-streaming technologies and approaches for web-based applications. *Multimedia Tools and Applications*, Vol. 77, pp. 6471-6502

Rodas, E. (2014). *The Multi-Facets of Cyber-Sex Trafficking: A Call for Action and Reform from Society.* Germany: GRIN Verlag

Suara. (2020). *Polisi Ungkap Kasus VCS Anak di Bawah Umur Tiga Pelaku Ditangkap.* Diakses melalui https://www.suara.com/news/2020/08/10/173116/polisi-ungkap-kasus-vcs-anak-di-bawah-umur-tiga-pelaku-ditangkap?page=all&_gl=1*x7c56a*_ga*YW1wLW13aHJQa2w4Z001dFlFTzhJUmQxNXFJeEUyeGZZOGJFLXYtc0cwQUJrYVB6SEJ1OG1OckFKSkNOUTRGOVNKN28.

Suara Jogja. (2020). *Cabuli Bayi Sambil Vcs Dengan Suami Pengasuh Berlagak Gantikan Popok.* Diakses melalui https://amp.suara.com/jogja/2020/08/10/184003/cabuli-bayi-sambil-vcs-dengan-suami-*babysitter*-berlagak-gantikan-popok

Terre Des Hommes. (2013). *Webcam Child Sex Tourism.* Diakses melalui http://tdh-europe.org/upload/document/6438/1696_Webcam-child-sex-tourism-terre-des-hommes-NL-nov-2013_original.pdf

Tribunnews. (2017). *Agus Iswanto Pengidap Pedofilia Ini Menyesal Setelah Cabuli Anak Kandung dan Keponakan Sendiri.* Diakses melalui

https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2017/05/25/agus-iswanto-pengidap-pedofilia-ini-menyesal-setelah-cabuli-anak-kandung-dan-keponakan-sendiri

UN News. (2020). *No country is free from child sexual abuse, exploitation, UN's top rights forum hears.* Diakses melalui https://news.un.org/en/story/2020/03/1058501

Whittle, H.C., & Giachritsis, C.H. (2017). *Offender Behaviour* dalam buku Online Risk to Children. UK: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Biographies of Author(s)

Ni Luh Tasya Prathisthita Tanaya, Department of Criminology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Indonesia.
- Email:
- ORCID:
- Web of Science ResearcherID:
- Scopus Author ID:
- Homepage:

Ni Made Martini Puteri, Department of Criminology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Indonesia.
- Email: martini.puteri@ui.ac.id
- ORCID:
- Web of Science ResearcherID:
- Scopus Author ID:
- Homepage: